ABC Science Collaborative

A public health initiative that unites science and schools to ensure a safe work and learning environment



Barriers to school return: Multiple pressing questions



Introducing the ABC Science Collaborative

What Is the ABC Science Collaborative?

A program that pairs scientists and physicians with school and community leaders to help understand the most current and relevant information about COVID-19. Seed funding from the National Institutes of Health.





THE ABC SCIENCE COLLABORATIVE

Learning | Informed Decision-Making | Research

The Team

Public health scientists and physicians affiliated with the Duke School of Medicine, the Duke Clinical Research Institute, and the University of North Carolina School of Medicine.

Duke University School of Medicine



ABC Science Collaborative: A data-driven approach to support decision making

Informing Evidence-Based Decision Making

Delivering Educational Resources for All

Advancing Public Health

- Superintendent support
- Coordination with state and local health departments
- Stakeholder groups









Piedmont-Triad / District 5

Alamance-Burlington School System Davidson County Schools Davie County Schools Guilford County Schools Lexington City Schools Mt. Airy City Schools Surry County Schools

Northwest Region / District 7

Alexander County Schools Ashe County Schools Caldwell County Schools Hickory City Schools

Western Region / District 8

Asheville City Schools

Thomasville City Schools Winston-Salem Forsyth Schools Yadkin County Schools

North Central Region / District 3

Chapel Hill-Carrboro City Schools Chatham County Schools Durham County Schools Edgecombe County Schools Franklin County Schools Granville County Schools Johnston County Schools Lee County Schools Nash County Public Schools Orange County Schools Vance County Schools Wake County School Warren County Schools Wilson County Schools

Sampson

runswick

Blader

Columbus

Robeson

Duplir

Northeast Region / District 1 Bertie County Schools Elizabeth City-Pasquotank Schools Gates County Schools Hertford County Schools Hyde County Schools Northampton County Schools Pitt County Schools

Sandhills Region / District 4

Cumberland County Schools Moore County Schools Scotland County Schools

> Additionally 12 charter schools

S tokes

Yadkin

Rockingham

Randolph

Southeast Region / District 2

Jones County Schools New Hanover County Schools Carteret County Public School System



Southwest Region / District 6

Cleveland County Schools Gaston County Schools Iredell Statesville Schools Kannapolis City Schools Mooresville Graded School District Stanly County Schools

Scotland County Scho

Changing landscape: vaccinations, variants, outbreaks

- Communities question: are vaccines safe, why should we get vaccinated, and when will teachers & students get vaccinated?
- $_{\odot}\,$ How will vaccinations impact school years 2020-21, 2021-22, and 2022-23?
 - 2020-2021 (some districts re-open)
 - \circ Late spring 2021, most school staff vaccinated
 - o 2021-2022 (most districts will re-open and most in hybrid)
 - August 2021, ~10% of school population vaccinated
 - Spring 2022, most students vaccinated
 - o 2022-2023 (schools largely open if they can provide safe environment)
 - Successfully dealing with variants that impact vaccines
 - Hot spots will continue to emerge



Existing partnerships

- \circ School Districts
 - Over 60 school board meetings to provide expertise and answer questions
 - Hundreds of faculty-to-school district leadership calls over past 20 weeks
 - Everything from activities (band, lunch, sports) to review of science (virology and epi 101)
 - On-site visits to special needs classrooms to understand masking
 - Ten districts with district-wide staff meetings
 - Dozens of meetings with community members
 - Nightly calls with school leadership teams throughout the state
- o Stakeholder organizations
 - NCDHHS
 - National Institutes of Health
 - Local members of AAP
 - North Carolina Association of Educators
 - National Educators Association



Immediate impact

 $\,\circ\,$ Successful return to in-person learning environment

- Developed methods and a process for quality improvement at scale
- $_{\odot}\,$ Developed educational materials and cycle of learning at scale

 \circ CDC meetings

- o prioritization of schools (first to open, last to close)
- \circ JAMA editorial
- \circ 12 principles for reopening
- School-specific metrics to evaluate school/district performance
- Developed trust with community leaders to conduct research



Research Project #1 Secondary transmission in schools

- In spring 2020, conventional wisdom was that closing schools is an effective and obvious mitigation strategy to prevent spread of infectious diseases
- By summer 2020, conventional wisdom was that in context of low community transmission, schools were not driving community spread
- Fundamentally a question of infection control: secondary transmission in schools is the key marker for whether or not schools can keep students and staff safe and if schools contribute to increases in community transmission
- 11 ABC districts agreed to track incidence and secondary transmission of SARS-CoV-2
- Local health department staff adjudicated secondary transmission
- Superintendents met weekly with ABCs faculty to share lessons learned and develop prevention methods



Zimmerman & Benjamin et al Pediatrics 2021

ABC-11 School Districts

District	Staff	Students in Person	Hispanic ¹	African American	Asian	White	Multiple Races ²	* Community Cases per 100,000 per 14 days as of Jan 26
1	967	3,972	11	4	1	78	5	882
2	626	2,163	12	<1	<1	82	4	584
3	1,073	5,068	15	7	1	72	5	878
4	3,847	19,434	15	22	2	54	7	1,083
5	727	2,835	26	19	5	40	10	1,025
6	3,399	16,523	14	14	3	63	6	1,247
7	254	628	11	35	<1	47	7	902
8	1,733	8,815	14	14	1	63	7	920
9	330	1,024	21	8	1	64	6	870
10	4,228	12,700	12	44	1	35	6	884
11	1,000	4,284	26	3	<1	66	4	935
* Manuscript reported Aug-Oct time frame but these districts continue to be succesful despite the winter surge								
¹ North Caroli	¹ North Carolina reports ethnicity as a separate category within race.							

²Races with <1% for all districts listed include Native American and Pacific Islander.



Secondary transmission in schools: results

- More than 90,000 students and staff attended school in-person for the first 9 weeks of instruction
- 773 community-acquired SARS-CoV-2 infections were documented by molecular testing
- Through contact tracing, NC health department staff determined an additional 32 infections were acquired within schools
- No instances of child-to-adult transmission of SARS-CoV-2 were reported within schools



Secondary transmission: Conclusions

- On average, NC residents infected with SARS-CoV-2 infected ~1.1 other individuals during these 9 weeks
- If secondary transmission were as common in schools as in the community, we would anticipate up to 900 secondary infections of SARS-CoV-2 within schools (not 32)
- Enforcing SARS-CoV-2 mitigation policies such as masking, physical distancing, and hand hygiene, resulted in
 - minimal clusters of SARS-CoV-2 infection
 - diminished secondary transmission in schools
 - No increase in community infection burden
- Successful return to in-person school
 - Defined by strong leadership
 - Defined by adherence to mitigation strategies
 - Not defined by community transmission









Learnings from the field

- School district access to healthcare professionals is variable
 - Questions of equity
- School specific data are key
 - Transparency to build and cultivate a culture of safety and trust
 - Case management increasingly complicated
 - Regular data analysis necessary to evaluate progress
- Rapid, consistent, transparent contact tracing and access to testing are important
 - Quickly identify in-school exposures
 - Effects of quarantine on staff availability
 - $\circ~$ School staff from counties outside school district
- o Adherence to mitigation strategies (masking) is increasingly important
 - Coronavirus variants



School-specific metrics

Cluster Event	Action Taken
Rapidly* increasing number of infections that are	Rapidly increasing number epidemiologically
linked epidemiologically within a school	linked across a school district
Substantial secondary transmission** within a	Substantial secondary transmission** in a school
school	district
District leadership discusses the safety benefits of	District leadership discusses the safety benefits of
remote learning for the individual school with the	district-wide remote instruction with the school
school board, an independent body, local heath	board, an independent body, the local health
department, and key stakeholders.	department, .and key stakeholders.
District leadership discusses the safety benefits of	District leadership discusses the safety benefits of
remote instruction for the individual school with	district-wide remote instruction with the school
the school board, an independent body, local	board, an independent body, the local health
health department, and key stakeholders.	department, and key stakeholders.

* Rapidly increasing number of infections for a school is defined as ≥15 linked cases within a two-week period

** Substantial secondary transmission: defined as >5 cases of COVID-test positive, within-school transmission per 1,000 students/week



12 Principles for safe schools



BE TRANSPARENT

Report all primary COVID-19 cases by week, by school.



MAKE A ROAD MAP FOR CONTACT TRACING AND TESTING

The school district and local health department(s) should make available publicly who will do what in a successful contact tracing.



DEVELOP A DASHBOARD

A pandemic management dashboard should include primary cases, secondary cases, testing rates, and comparisons to county-wide data.



IMPLEMENT LESSONS LEARNED

School leadership should work with staff to understand secondary transmissions and to implement lessons learned.



WORK WITH A TRUSTED THIRD PARTY TO ANALYZE DATA For example, partner with the ABC Science Collaborative.

LEVERAGE SCHOOL-BASED METRICS

6

Secondary transmission per 10,000 students and number of clusters per 10,000 students are metrics that are preferable to county data because the crucial element of managing schools is to prevent spread within schools.





12 Principles, cont.

FIGHT PANDEMIC FATIGUE



Target >99 percent adherence to masking by all mainstream curriculum students, teachers, and staff on school property at all times (except for eating and drinking). Use an anonymous hot line or web portal to report non-compliance or a simple daily walkthrough to check that all masks are over the nose, mouth, and chin.



MAKE A DETAILED SCHEDULE

Customize the schedule for each school. Examples for elementary, middle, and high schools are available from the ABC Science Collaborative. *The Toolkit is especially important here.*



CONSIDER EXTRACURRICULARS

In addition to a detailed plan for the general school day, develop a detailed plan for all extracurricular and school-sponsored activities such as sports and the arts.



CONSIDER SPECIAL NEEDS

This group of teachers and students need additional precautions. Plans should be developed locally, and these groups should receive allocation of extra resources because masking is not always possible.



DEVELOP A COMMUNICATION PLAN

How will districts communicate, with whom, and when? Develop a communication plan that is detailed, but that can be revisied as new data and insights come to light.



WALK, THEN RUN

A defined return to in-person learning (for example, in a hybrid model) can give everyone a chance to adapt to new procedures and policies.





The importance of research to navigate the future

- Incidence of secondary transmission (changing class sizes, community rates, different age groups)
- $\circ\,$ When we talk about 'community metrics' to re-open, what is the 'community'
 - The country, the state, the county, the hospital catchment area, *the school*
- $_{\odot}\,$ Effect of quarantine on school staff availability
- $_{\odot}\,$ Adherence to masking within school buildings
- Educational effects of COVID-19
- $\,\circ\,$ Incidence of long-haulers syndrome in children
- $_{\odot}\,$ Mental health effects of COVID-19 on school-age children
- $_{\odot}\,$ Vaccine uptake and long-term effects



Won't this all go away? Think about the seasons of COVID

2020 Spring: Children are super spreaders, close schools Data, they're not super spreaders^{1,2,3}

2020 Summer: we need low community transmission, close schools Data, widespread community transmission, schools can be safe^{2,3,4,5}

- 2020-2021 Fall/Winter: Surge is coming/surge is here, close schools Data, in high incidence communities, schools can be safe^{6,7,8,9}
- 2021 Spring: vaccinate the adults, close schools Despite vaccination, schools continue to stay closed¹⁰
- 2021 Summer: well, it's summer, good thing schools are closed
- 2021 Fall: we need to vaccinate children, we should close schools¹¹
- 2021 Winter: another winter surge is coming, we should close schools
- 2022 Spring: new variants that evade vaccine, we should close schools
- 2022 Summer: whew, it's summer, good thing schools are closed
- 2022-2021 School year, see above

- 1) European CDC, 2020
- 2) NCIRS, Australia, 2020
- 3) Dub, et al., 2020
- 4) Danis et al., 2020
- 5) Yung, et al., 2020
- 6) Hobbs et al 2020
- 7) Zimmerman et al 2021
- 8) Falk et al 2021
- 9) UNICEF Quarterly Report, 2020
- 10) New Jersey Schools, 2021
- 11) Fairfax Schools, 2021



Expansion Concept 1) National infrastructure

2) Scientific support for communities

3) Research Data: COVID-19 and its impact on children and families



• Coordinating center:

- o Duke University
- "Playbook" and customized support for interaction with local stakeholders
- Resource for hubs: educational materials, policies, communications specialists
- o Data management
- Resource allocation

• Hubs:

- $\circ~$ CA, GA, KY, MO, MI, NC, OH, OK, WI
- o Faculty leadership
- Local interaction with school districts, local stakeholders
- \circ Recruit for research studies
- $\circ~$ Sites:
 - local districts



References

- 1) European center for disease control, 2020 <u>https://www.ecdc.europa.eu/sites/default/files/documents/COVID-19-schools-transmission-August%202020.pdf</u>
- 2) NCIRS Australia, 2020 <u>https://ncirs.org.au/sites/default/files/2020-</u> 04/NCIRS%20NSW%20Schools%20COVID_Summary_FINAL%20public_26%20April%202020.pdf
- 3) Dub, et al., 2020 (https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2020.07.20.20156018v1.full.pdf)
- 4) Danis et al., 2020 (https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/32277759/)
- 5) Heavey, et al., 2020 (<u>https://www.eurosurveillance.org/content/10.2807/1560-7917.ES.2020.25.21.2000903</u>)
- 6) Yung, et al., 2020 (https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC7337629/)
- 7) Hobbs, et al., 2020 <u>https://www.cdc.gov/mmwr/volumes/69/wr/mm6950e3.htm</u>
- 8) Zimmerman KO, et al Incidence and secondary transmission of SARS-CoV-2 infections in schools. *Pediatrics*. 2021. doi:<u>10.1542/peds.2020-048090</u>
- 9) Falk A, et al. COVID-19 cases and transmission in 17 K-12 schools—Wood County, Wisconsin, August 31-November 29, 2020. *MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep*. doi:<u>10.15585/mmwr.mm7004e3</u>
- 10) UNICEF <u>https://www.unicef.org/media/89046/file/In-person-schooling-and-covid-19-transmission-review-of-evidence-2020.pdf</u>
- 11)New Jersey Schools <u>https://www.nj.com/education/2021/01/vaccinating-teachers-wont-be-enough-to-fully-open-all-nj-schools-heres-why.html</u>
- 12)Fairfax County Schools https://reason.com/2020/10/20/fairfax-teachers-union-schools-closed-vaccine/



Perspective







Thank you.



Learning Informed Decision-Making Research